

تَحْقِيقُ الْكَلَامِ

فِي

أَفْضَلِ بَهِيمَةِ الْأَنْعَامِ

The Sufficient Discourse

Regarding

The Best Sacrificial Beast

Abū Sahl Adebayo DhikruLlāhi

Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Introductory Note | 3 |
| The Reports and the Opinions of the Four Schools | 5 |
| Hanafi School | 5 |
| Maaliki School..... | 6 |
| Shafi' and Hanbali Schools..... | 7 |
| Establishing the Authentic Position..... | 9 |
| From Al Qur'an | 9 |
| From the Sunnah | 10 |
| The Weak Report | 12 |
| Reference..... | 14 |

Introductory Note

Praise is to Allāh the All knowing and I seek blessing upon the noble soul of Prophet Muhammad (SallaLlaahu 'alayhi wa sallam).

To proceed,

This précis mainly contains the succinct discussions on the issue of the best animal to slaughter to worship Allāh in days of 'Id Al Udhiyah. Basically, the sacrificial beasts are generally recommended as Allāh says:

قَالَ تَعَالَى: لِيَشْهَدُوا مَنَفِعَ لَهُمْ وَيَذْكُرُوا اسْمَ اللَّهِ فِي أَيَّامٍ
مَّعْلُومَاتٍ عَلَىٰ مَا رَزَقَهُم مِّنْ بَهِيمَةِ الْأَنْعَامِ فَكُلُوا مِنْهَا
وَأَطِيعُوا أَلْبَآئِسَ الْفَقِيرِ ﴿٢٨﴾ الْحَجَّ: ﴿٢٨﴾

That they may witness things that are of benefit to them (i.e. reward of Hajj in the Hereafter, and also some worldly gain from trade, etc.), and mention the Name of Allah on appointed days (i.e. 10th, 11th, 12th, and 13th day of Dhul-Hijjah), over the beast of cattle that He has provided for them (for sacrifice) (at the time of their slaughtering by saying: Bismillah, Wallahu-Akbar, Allahumma Minka wa Ilaik). Then eat thereof and feed

therewith the poor who have a very hard time. (Al Hajj (22):28)

The sacrificial beast includes camel, cow, sheep and goat¹. And the best of each class is the healthiest, biggest, and most attractive with much meat.²

The Messenger of Allaah said:

لا تذبحوا إلا مُسِنَّةً إلا أن يعسرَ عليكم فتذبحوا جذعةً من الضأن

Sacrifice only a grown-up animal, unless it is difficult for you, in which case sacrifice a ram (of even less than a year, but more than six months' age).³

¹ Tafseer Al Qur'aan Al Adheem 3/1940

² Al Muhalla 7/370; Ahkaam Al Udhhiyah of Ash Shaykh Saalih Al 'Uthaymeen p.24

³ Saheeh Muslim 1963

The Reports and the Opinions of the Four Schools

Hanafi School

Aaisah (radiyaLlaahu ‘anhah) the wife of the Prophet of Allaah said,

أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ سُئِلَ عَنِ الرَّقَابِ : أَيُّهَا أَفْضَلُ فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ : " أَغْلَاهَا ثَمَنًا وَأَنْفُسُهَا عِنْدَ أَهْلِهَا

The Messenger of Allaah (sallaLlaahu ‘alayhi wa sallam) was asked: "What is the best kind of manumission (of slaves)?" He replied, "The manumission of the most expensive slave and the most beloved by his master."⁴

Al Hanafiyyah opines that, the beast with most meat is the best⁵, likewise Al Imaam Ash Shawkaanee.⁶

⁴ Muwatta Imaam Maalim 1609; Ash Shaykh Saalim bn ‘Id Al Hilaaliy Abu Usaamah graded it authentic in Al Muwatta bir Riwaayatihi Ath Thamaaniyah 4/52

⁵ Al Istidhkaar 15/136

⁶ Ad Daraariy Al Mudhiyah p.399

Maaliki School

Narrated Anas bin Malik:

كَانَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يُضَحِّي بِكَبْشَيْنِ وَأَنَا أُضَحِّي بِكَبْشَيْنِ

The Prophet used to offer two rams as sacrifices, and I also used to offer two rams.⁷

The best is the ram, then camel; considering the sumptuous of its meat and the Prophet (SallaLl āhu ‘alayhi wa sallam) slaughtered two rams and he would do nothing but the best and if Allaah knew any other beast better than it, He would have ransomed it with Ishaq (or Ismaail)⁸

⁷ Saheeh Al Bukhaaree 5553

⁸ Al Istidhkaar 15/136; Al Kaafi fee Fihi Al Maalik p.421; Nayl Al Awtaar 5/125

Shafi' and Hanbali Schools

Narrated Abu Hurairah:

مَنْ اغْتَسَلَ يَوْمَ الْجُمُعَةِ غُسْلَ الْجَنَابَةِ ثُمَّ رَاحَ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَرَّبَ بَدَنَةً وَمَنْ رَاحَ فِي
السَّاعَةِ الثَّانِيَةِ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَرَّبَ بَقْرَةً وَمَنْ رَاحَ فِي السَّاعَةِ الثَّلَاثَةِ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَرَّبَ
كَبْشًا أَقْرَنَ وَمَنْ رَاحَ فِي السَّاعَةِ الرَّابِعَةِ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَرَّبَ دَجَاجَةً وَمَنْ رَاحَ فِي
السَّاعَةِ الْخَامِسَةِ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَرَّبَ بَيْضَةً فَإِذَا خَرَجَ الْإِمَامُ حَضَرَتِ الْمَلَائِكَةُ
يَسْتَمِعُونَ الذِّكْرَ

The Messenger of Allaah (sallaLlaahu 'alayhi wa sallam) said, "Any person who takes a bath on Friday like the bath of Janaba and then goes for the prayer (in the first hour i.e. early), it is as if he had sacrificed a camel (in Allah's cause); and whoever goes in the second hour it is as if he had sacrificed a cow; and whoever goes in the third hour, then it is as if he had sacrificed a horned ram; and if one goes in the fourth hour, then it is as if he had sacrificed a hen; and whoever goes in the fifth hour then it is as if he had offered an egg.⁹

⁹ Saheeh al Bukhaaree 881, Saheeh Muslim 850, Sunan Abee Daawud 351 and Sunan An Nasaa'ee 864

With this report Ash-Shaafi'yah¹⁰, Al Hanaabilah¹¹ and other scholars¹² opine that camel is the most virtuous, since:

- i. It has enough meat.
- ii. It is more enough to be distributed to the poor.
- iii. It was firstly mentioned in the report.¹³

¹⁰ Al Haawiy Al Kabir 29/92

¹¹ 'Umdah Al Fiqh p.51; Al Muqni' fee Fiqhi Al Hanbali p.132; Manaar As Sabeel Sharh Ad Daleel 1/271; Zaad Al Mustaqni' p.95

¹² Al Istsdhkaar 15/36; Fataawa Al Lajnah Ad Daaimah 11/398; Ahkaam Al Udhhiyah of Ash Shaykh Sālih Al 'Uthaymeen p.24; Dhakeerah Al 'Uqbah 33/324

¹³ Al Istidhkaar 15/136

Establishing the Authentic Position

From Al Qur'an

Allaah says:

قَالَ أَمْأَلَىٰ لِلْإِنسَانِ إِذْ ذَبَحَ عَظِيمًا ﴿١٠٧﴾ الصافات: ﴿١٠٧﴾

And We ransomed him with a great sacrifice.

Al Imaam al Qurtubee¹⁴, As Sama'aanee¹⁵, Ibn Katheer¹⁶ and Al Imaam Ahmad Shaakir said: The authentic is, this is what the majority are upon) and others among the scholars of Tafseer said: (He was ransomed) with a ram.¹⁷

Al Imaam al Qurtubee Al Maalikee concluded: In this verse (there is) evidence that slaughtering ram is more virtuous than camel.¹⁸

¹⁴ Al Jaami' Al Ahkaam Al Qur'aan 15/79, Edtn Maktabah As Saffaa.

¹⁵ Tafseer Al Qur'aan As Sama'aanee 4/409

¹⁶ Tafsir Al Qur'aan Adheem 4/2422

¹⁷ 'Umadatut Tafsir Ikhtisaar Tafsir ibn Kathir 2/152

¹⁸ Al Jaami' Al Ahkaam Al Qur'aan 15/79

From the Sunnah

Narrated Anas bin Malik: The Prophet used to offer two rams as sacrifices, and I also used to offer two rams.¹⁹

Ibn Hajar said: The statement of Anas; that he also used to offer two rams to follow the Prophet and contains an indication of *Idaamah* (constantly slaughtering of ram during festival).²⁰

A'ishah reported that;

أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَمَرَ بِكَبْشٍ أَقْرَنَ يَطَأُ فِي سَوَادٍ وَيَبْرُكُ فِي سَوَادٍ وَيَنْظُرُ فِي سَوَادٍ فَأُتِيَ بِهِ لِيُضَحِّيَ بِهِ

Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) commanded that a ram with black legs, black belly and black (circles) round the eyes should be brought to him, so that he should sacrifice it.²¹

Though, the majority of the scholars also say: The prophet killed ram to ease the affairs of his Ummah (not to overburden them). This is weak for three reasons:

¹⁹ Its reference has preceded

²⁰ Fat'h al Baaree 10/10

²¹ Saheeh Muslim 1967

- i. No prophetic back up for the reasons.
- ii. The Prophet would choose the best and most pleasing to The Lord, especially to worship his Lord –the Sublime.
- iii. Even, if it is for the easiness upon his Ummah, should the Ummah then overburden themselves?

The evidences of the majority of the scholars are general, while the evidences of Imaam Maalik and his comrades are specific.

The scholars of usool do say:

الخاص مقدم على العام

The specific evidence takes precedence over the general evidence.

The view of Imaam Maalik, his comrades, Al Haafidh Ibn Mulaqan Ash Shaafi'yy²² Ash Shawkaanee²³, Sidiq Hasaan Khaan²⁴ and Shaykh bn Baaz²⁵ calms the mind as the best guidance, is the guidance of Muhammad.

²² Ilaam bif Fawaaid 'Umdatil Ahkaam 10/181

²³ Nayl Al Awtaar Sharh Muntaqaa Al Akhbaar 5/125

²⁴ At Taliqaat Ar Radiyah ala Ar Rawdatin Nadiyyah 3/130

The Weak Report

Zayd bn Arqam reported:

قَالَ أَصْحَابُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ : يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ مَا هَذِهِ الْأَضَاحِيُّ
 قَالَ : " سُنَّةُ أَبِيكُمْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ " . قَالُوا : فَمَا لَنَا فِيهَا يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ : " بِكُلِّ
 شَعْرَةٍ حَسَنَةً " . قَالُوا : فَالْصُّوفُ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ : " بِكُلِّ شَعْرَةٍ مِنَ الصُّوفِ
 حَسَنَةً "

The Companions asked, 'O Messenger of Allah! What is Udhiyah?' He replied, 'It is the Sunnah of your father Ibrahim (alayhis salam).' They asked again, 'What benefit do we get from it?' He answered, 'A reward for every hair (of the sacrificed animal).' 'And [what reward is there for animals with] wool, O Messenger of Allah?'

²⁵ al Majmoo' 18/43, listen also to his audio:
<https://binbaz.org.sa/fatwas/14498/%D8%A7%D9%81%D8%B6%D9%84%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A7%D8%B6%D8%AD%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%BA%D9%86%D9%85-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A8%D9%82%D8%B1-%D9%88%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A7%D8%A8%D9%84>

they asked. ‘A reward’, he said, ‘for every fibre of the wool.’²⁶

So, it is not allowed to attribute it to the Prophet (SallaLlaahu ‘alayhi wa sallam) and extract ruling from it.

This is the end of the treatise. I beseech Allaah to grant me success here and hereafter.

Abū Sahl al Atharee.

8/12/1440 (Fri, Aug 9, 2019)

Edited on 16/11/1441 (Wed 8 of July, 2020)

²⁶ Sunan Ibn Maajah 3127; Al Imaam Ibn Mundhir classed it weak in At Targhib wat Tarbhib 2/159, likewise Al Imaam Al Albaanee in Silsilah Ahaadeeth As Saheehah 527.

Reference

- Al Qur'an al Kareem

Books of Exegesis

- Al Jaami' Al Ahkaam Al Qurtubi
- Tafseer Al Qur'an As Sama'aanee
- Tafseer Al Qur'an Al Adheem of Ibn Kathir
- 'Umdatut Tafseer Ikhtisaar Tafseer ibn Katheer of Ash Shaykh Ahmad Shaakir

Books of Hadeeth

- Saheeh Al Bukhaaree
- Saheeh Muslim
- Sunan Abee Daawud
- Sunan Ibn Maajah
- Al Muwatta Imaam Maalik
- Targhib wa Tarhib ibn Mundhir
- Silsilah Ahaadeeth Da'ifah
- Al Muwatta bir Riwaayatihi Ath Thamaaniyyah of Ash Shaykh Saalih Al Hilaali
- Al Muhalla of Ibn Hazm Al Aandalusi

Books of Islamic Jurisprudence and others

- Al Kaafi fi Fiqhi Al Maalikiy of Ibn Abdil Bare An Namree Al Andalusiy
- Al Muqni' fee Fiqhi Hanbali

- ‘Umdah Al Fiqh
- Manaar As Sabil Sharh Ad Daleel
- Zaad Al Mustaqni’
- Al Istidhkaar
- ‘ilaam bi Fawaaid ‘Umdatil Ahkaam ibn Mulaqan
- Fat’h Al Baaree
- Al Haawi Al Kabeer
- Nayl al Awtaar
- Ad Daarari al Mudhiyyah Sharh Ad Durar Al Bahiyyah
- At Taliqaat Ar Radiyyah ala Rawdatun Nadiyyah
- Majmu’ Al Fataawa of Ash Shaykh Abdul ‘Azeez bn Baz
- Fataawa Al Lajnah Ad Daaimah
- Ahkaam Udhiyah of As Shaykh Saalih Al ‘Uthaymeen